

ANALYSIS OF INSTRUCTIONAL LEADERSHIP MODELS IN ISLAMIC RELIGIOUS EDUCATION MANAGEMENT

Mim Fadhli Rabbi¹, Dina Hermina^{2*}, Yahya Mof³
^{1,2,3} Universitas Islam Negeri Antasari Banjarmasin, Indonesia
e-mail: dinahermina@uin-antasari.ac.id

Abstract: This research examines instructional leadership models in educational contexts, focusing on transformational, transactional, and Islamic value-based approaches. A comprehensive literature study explored the complex dynamics of contemporary educational leadership. The research demonstrates that each leadership model possesses unique characteristics influencing organizational effectiveness. Transformational leadership highlights structural inspiration and motivation, while transactional leadership emphasizes exchange mechanisms and incentives. The Islamic value-based model integrates spiritual dimensions and moral ethics in leadership practices. Findings indicate the importance of a holistic approach that synergizes managerial, psychological, and spiritual aspects in building a dynamic and high-quality educational ecosystem. Research implications emphasize the need for adaptive leadership models capable of responding to the complexity of contemporary educational challenges.

Keywords: Instructional Leadership, Transformational, Islamic Values

Copyright (c) 2024 The Authors. This is an open-access article under the CC BY-SA 4.0 license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>)

INTRODUCTION

Leadership in the context of education is a complex construction that goes beyond just delegating administrative authority, but rather a strategic representation of systemic transformation in the academic ecosystem. Research Irawan et al., (2022) emphasizes that not all power holders can be categorized as authentic leaders, but every true leader embodies meaningful and constructive power within the framework of developing human resource potential. In the contemporary educational landscape, instructional leadership emerges as a fundamental paradigm specifically focused on optimizing pedagogical processes and learning outcomes. This construct puts education leaders, especially school principals, in an epicenter position in creating a responsive, dynamic, and sustainable academic ecosystem. The significance of instructional leadership is not just abstract but has fundamental practical implications in transforming the quality of education (Faridh et al., 2024).

The complexity of the implementation of instructional leadership is manifested through a series of systemic challenges that require in-depth analysis. Khumaini and Wiranata (2021) identified that the limitations of professional development of education leaders significantly affect their capacity to implement effective leadership models. This competency deficit not only has an impact on the administrative mechanism but also directly affects the quality of pedagogical interaction and academic achievement of students. Diversification of instructional leadership models demands a highly contextual and adaptive approach. Each model has unique characteristics that cannot be transferred mechanically across educational institutions. The variability of contextual factors-such as organizational culture, demographic

characteristics of students, pedagogical infrastructure, and socio-cultural dynamics-forms a complex and dynamic educational ecosystem.

In-depth research on leadership in Islamic education shows that leadership construction is not just related to structural mechanisms, but rather a manifestation of universal values that are integrated in pedagogical practice. The value-based approach is critical in transforming the educational environment, where every leadership interaction is interpreted as a process of empowering and developing individual potential. Interpersonal collaboration between leaders and educators is an absolute prerequisite for the successful implementation of instructional leadership. The absence of effective communication and professional synergy can hinder the implementation of innovative leadership models. Paradigmatic reconstruction in understanding the dynamics of leadership relationships in educational institutions is imperative to create a transformative academic environment.

This study aims to comprehensively explore the complex dynamics of instructional leadership, with the main focus on an in-depth analysis of transformational, transactional, and value-based leadership models in the context of Islamic education. Through systematic investigation, this study seeks to identify effective mechanisms that can optimize educational leadership capacity. Methodologically, the research will use a qualitative approach with a comprehensive literature study method. The analysis will focus on the theoretical and practical exploration of leadership models, taking into account the specific context of Islamic education in Indonesia. The theoretical framework will be built through the critical synthesis of various existing academic and empirical perspectives.

The significance of the research lies in its potential to transform the educational leadership paradigm. By integrating theoretical and practical approaches, this study seeks to make a substantive contribution in optimizing the quality of instructional leadership, especially in the context of contemporary Islamic education. The implications of this study are expected to provide practical guidance for education leaders in developing more effective, responsive, and value-based leadership strategies. Furthermore, this research is expected to enrich the academic discourse on educational leadership and provide a conceptual framework for the professional development of future educational leaders.

METHOD

This study adopts a qualitative approach with a comprehensive literature study methodology, which is designed to systematically and in-depth explore the dynamics of instructional leadership models in the context of Islamic education. This research method was chosen to allow for a critical and holistic analysis of various theoretical and practical constructions of complex and multidimensional leadership. The data collection process is carried out through library research which involves systematic exploration of reputable academic sources. The main focus of data collection is to identify, analyze, and synthesize relevant academic references, including scientific journals, academic textbooks, research reports, and scientific publications that address instructional leadership models. The methodological stages of the study are designed in a structured manner to ensure the validity and reliability of the findings. The process begins with the comprehensive identification of sources of information that have academic credibility. The selection criteria for sources included the depth of analysis, originality of scientific contributions, methodological accuracy, and relevance to the focus of research on leadership models in Islamic education.

The data analysis technique uses a critical content analysis approach that allows researchers to not only describe but also interpret and criticize existing theoretical constructions. The analysis process is carried out through several systematic stages, namely categorization, interpretation, comparison, and critical synthesis of various existing perspectives. Data categorization is focused on identifying the unique characteristics of each leadership model—transformational, transactional, and value-based. Each model is analyzed based on specific theoretical, practical, and contextual dimensions within the framework of Islamic education. This process allows for a comprehensive understanding of the nuances and complexities of each leadership model. The interpretation stage involves a critical deconstruction of existing theoretical constructs, taking into account the social, cultural, and institutional contexts that encompass the practice of educational leadership. This research does not just accept the existing theoretical narrative but develops a deep and critical analytical perspective. The comparison process is carried out to identify convergence and divergence points among various leadership models.

Through a comparative approach, the research seeks to understand how each model contributes to the development of a holistic and transformative Islamic education ecosystem. Critical synthesis is the final stage in the analysis process, where various findings and perspectives are integrated to produce a comprehensive conceptual framework. This stage aims to produce a theoretical model that is not just descriptive, but able to provide practical recommendations for the development of educational leadership. The validity of the research is guaranteed through triangulation of sources and methods. Diverse data sources and multidimensional analysis approaches ensure that the research findings have high academic credibility. Each argument is supported by credible and scientifically accountable academic references. The methodological limitation of this research lies in library research, which cannot directly observe leadership practices in the field. However, the comprehensive approach and critical analysis used can make a significant contribution to understanding the complexity of instructional leadership models in the context of Islamic education.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Transformational Leadership Model in the Context of Education

Transformational leadership is a revolutionary leadership paradigm in the context of contemporary education, which is conceptually rooted in the process of transforming the potential of educational resources. As expressed by AbuTineh et al. (2008), this leadership model does not only regulate structural mechanisms but presents a fundamental transformation in the organizational dynamics of education. Yukl in Wibawa (2012) defines transformational leadership as a systematic process that affects the entire member of the organization, with the main focus on building commitment to advance the mission and organizational goals. The main characteristics of this model include four integral dimensions: idealistic influence, inspiration, intellectual stimulation, and individual consideration. Idealistic influence is the essence of transformational leadership, where leaders can create inspiring visions, instill pride, and gain respect through high moral standards. Purwanto et al., (2020) asserts that this dimension allows leaders to change the perspectives and aspirations of followers, transforming individual potential into collective strength.

The inspiration dimension presents powerful communication skills, where leaders can construct motivational narratives that encourage followers to go beyond the limits of

conventional capabilities. Filippus Cahyo Setyawan et al., (2024) show that this aspect plays a significant role in creating a dynamic and adaptive work environment. Intellectual stimulation in transformational leadership encourages the creation of space for creativity and innovation. Agustin et al., (2023) identify that through this dimension, leaders encourage followers to explore new approaches, question established assumptions, and develop innovative solutions to solving complex problems. Individual considerations represent the leader's holistic concern for the personal development of each member. Diswantika & Yustiana (2022) emphasizes that this dimension does not just provide instrumental attention, but presents an empathetic approach that supports the growth of individual capacities.

Transactional Leadership Model in Education

Transactional leadership is built on the principle of systematic interpersonal exchange between leaders and subordinates. Ulil Multazam (2023) explained that this model prioritizes contractual mechanisms based on agreements on achieving goals, work standards, and reward systems. The main characteristics of transactional leadership are identified through two fundamental mechanisms: contingent reward and management by exception. Contingent rewards construct an incentive system that provides performance-based rewards, both in the form of bonuses, facility improvements, and formal recognition. Management by exception has two distinct variants. The active variant involves continuous monitoring and proactive intervention to prevent potential errors. Meanwhile, the passive variant only provides a corrective response when performance standards are not met.

The transactional leadership model assumes that subordinate motivation can be built through external incentive mechanisms and structured exchanges of interests. Leaders play a role in creating frameworks, while subordinates implement tasks according to specific skill sets. In the context of education, transactional leadership operates as a managerial mechanism that creates a transparent organizational structure, provides technical guidance, and ensures performance accountability. Although considered less transformative than alternative leadership models, this approach still has significance in creating a measurable and systematic organizational ecosystem. In Islam, to study and explore a phenomenon, it must be based on the Qur'an and hadith. It is no exception to see and explore leadership from an Islamic perspective. In the Qur'an there are many verses related to and teach us about leaders and leadership. One of them is in Surah al-Baqarah verse 30 Allah says:

وَإِذْ قَالَ رَبُّكَ لِلْمَلٰٓئِكَةِ اِنِّيْ جَاعِلٌ فِى الْاَرْضِ خَلِيْفَةًۭۙ قَالُوْۤا اَجْعَلْ فِيْهَا مَنۢ يُفْسِدُ
فِيْهَا وَيَسْفِكُ الدِّمَآءَ وَنَحْنُ نُسَبِّحُ بِحَمْدِكَ وَنُقَدِّسُ لَكَۗ قَالَ اِنِّيْۤ اَعْلَمُ مَا لَا تَعْلَمُوْنَ

﴿٣٠﴾

Meaning: (Remember) when your Lord said to the angels, "I want to make a caliph on earth." They said, "Do you want to make a man who destroys and sheds blood there, while we praise You and sanctify Your name?" He said, "Verily I know what you do not know."

Value-Based Leadership in Islamic Education: Philosophical and Normative Frameworks

Leadership in the Islamic perspective is a multidimensional concept that goes beyond just an administrative mechanism but integrates spiritual values and fundamental ethics. The basic principles of Islamic leadership are built on a philosophical foundation rooted in the teachings of the Qur'an and Hadith, which prioritize the concept of trust and moral responsibility. Justice (al-'adl) is the main pillar in the construction of Islamic leadership, which refers to the proportional distribution of rights and obligations, as emphasized in Q.S. An-Nisa verse 58. Honesty (ash-shidq) and moral integrity are the essence of prophetic leadership, which does not simply emphasize formal accountability, but spiritual transformation. (Oktavianti & Prayogi, 2024) emphasizes that exemplary (uswah hasanah) is a fundamental instrument in building leadership credibility, where a leader is required to be an example in every action and decision. Responsibility (mas'uliyah) in this context is understood holistically, including horizontal accountability to humans and vertical accountability to the Creator.

Spirituality in Islamic leadership is not just an abstract concept, but a concrete practice that is integrated in every managerial aspect. (Ragnhild Eg et al., 2023) identified that the systematic implementation of spiritual values is able to improve organizational performance through the internal transformation of actors. This shows that Islamic leadership does not only focus on external achievements, but also on building spiritual and moral capacity.

Comparative Analysis and Integration of Leadership Models

The comparison between transformational and transactional leadership models in the Islamic context presents a complex and multivariate perspective. Transformational leadership with its inspirational characteristics is fundamentally aligned with the principles of prophetic leadership, which emphasize the empowerment and development of individual potential. In contrast, transactional leadership with its mechanisms of exchange and incentives provides a structural framework that can be integrated with Islamic ethical concepts. The concept of Ulil Amri in the Islamic tradition provides a unique nuance in understanding leadership dynamics. There are a variety of interpretations that have developed, ranging from an understanding that refers to government authority to a more comprehensive understanding that includes intellectual and spiritual leaders. (Nasukah et al., 2020) explained that Ulil Amri's authority is not absolute, but limited to humanitarian and social affairs, with strict ethical boundaries. The integration of Islamic values in contemporary leadership models requires a dialogical and adaptive approach. Ethical and moral principles are not understood as static constructs, but rather dynamic systems that are responsive to evolving socio-cultural contexts. This approach allows for a synthesis between the classical Islamic leadership tradition and the demands of modernity.

Practical Implications and Future Projections

The implementation of the Islamic value-based leadership model in the context of education requires a comprehensive strategy involving systemic transformation. Leadership development is not enough only through a technical approach, but requires a deep internalization of spiritual and ethical values. Recruitment, capacity building, and leadership evaluation strategies must be designed to accommodate moral and spiritual dimensions. Contemporary challenges of Islamic education leadership include the complexity of globalization, digitalization, and shifting social paradigms. Future leadership models are required to be able to integrate tradition with innovation, spirituality with efficiency, and locality with universality. This requires epistemological flexibility and high adaptability. The

projection of the development of future leadership models cannot be separated from the context of sustainable social transformation. An interdisciplinary approach that synergizes theological, psychological, and managerial insights is a necessity in facing the complexity of contemporary educational challenges.

CONCLUSION

Educational leadership is a multidimensional construct that requires a comprehensive and integrative approach. This research reveals that the transformational, transactional, and Islamic value-based leadership model has a significant contribution to shaping a dynamic and quality education ecosystem. Each model offers a unique perspective on understanding the complexities of instructional leadership. Transformational leadership can transform the potential of resources through inspiration and motivation, while transactional leadership provides a measurable structural framework. The Islamic values-based model integrates spiritual dimensions and moral ethics, creating a holistic approach that goes beyond conventional managerial paradigms. The significance of the research lies in the understanding that educational leadership is not just an administrative mechanism, but rather a complex process that requires a synthesis between managerial, psychological, and spiritual aspects.

SUGGESTION

1. Development of a more adaptive and integrative educational leadership model, taking into account multicultural contexts and global dynamics.
2. Implementation of a sustainable leadership capacity-building program, with a focus on internalizing ethical values and spirituality.
3. Further research in more depth to explore the dynamic interactions between different leadership models in different educational contexts.

REFERENCE

- Agustin, C. S., Sari, T. D. V., Aisyah, P., & Anshori, M. I. (2023). Pengembangan Keterampilan Adaptabilitas Karyawan. *Jurnal Nuansa: Publikasi Ilmu Manajemen Dan Ekonomi Syariah*, 1(4), 119–140. <https://doi.org/10.61132/nuansa.v1i4.363>
- Deshwal, V., & Ashraf Ali, M. (2020). A Systematic Review of Various Leadership Theories. *Shanlax International Journal of Commerce*, 8(1), 38–43. <https://doi.org/10.34293/commerce.v8i1.916>
- Diswantika, N., & Yustiana, Y. R. (2022). Model Bimbingan Dan Konseling Bermain Cognitive-Behavior Play Therapy Untuk Mengembangkan Empati Mahasiswa. *Jurnal Mahasiswa BK An-Nur: Berbeda, Bermakna, Mulia*, 8(1), 40. <https://doi.org/10.31602/jmbkan.v8i1.6215>
- Faridh, M., Sari, E., & Putri, T. A. (2024). *MEMBANGUN PEMIMPIN YANG EFEKTIF : ANALISIS KECERDASAN EMOSIONAL*. 4(3), 1–10.
- Filippus Cahyo Setyawan, Sri Sundari, & Marisi Pakpahan. (2024). Evaluasi Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Kinerja Personel Dalam Konteks Lingkungan Kerja Yang

- Dinamis. *Lokawati : Jurnal Penelitian Manajemen Dan Inovasi Riset*, 2(2), 282–290. <https://doi.org/10.61132/lokawati.v1i2.671>
- Firdaus, D. R., Khairunnisa, K., Zohriah, A., & Fauzi, A. (2023). Analisis Model Kepemimpinan Kharismatik dan Visioner di Pondok Pesantren. *Journal on Education*, 5(4), 15038–15049. <https://doi.org/10.31004/joe.v5i4.2588>
- Irawan, A. R., Supriyatno, T., & Fatahillah, F. R. (2022). Implementation of Islamic Universal Values-based Leadership Power at State Islamic Higher Education. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 5(3), 1025–1035. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i3.2531>
- Nasukah, B., Harsoyo, R., & Winarti, E. (2020). Internalisasi Nilai-Nilai Kepemimpinan Profetik di Lembaga Pendidikan Islam. *Dirasat: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Pendidikan Islam*, 6(1), 52–68.
- Nurmayanti, N., & Ferdiansyah, H. (2021). Pemanfaatan Aplikasi Remote Desktop Teamviewer pada Praktikum Jarak Jauh di Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan Negeri 5 Sidrap. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 5(5), 4261–4270. <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v5i5.1514>
- Oktavianti, I. N., & Prayogi, I. (2024). Korpus Pembelajar Sebagai Big Data dalam Pengajaran Bahasa Inggris Di Era Masyarakat 5.0. In *Transformasi Pendidikan Abad XXI : Sebuah Bunga Rampai*.
- Purwanto, A., Sopa, A., Primahendra, R., Kusumaningsih, S. W., & Pramono, R. (2020). Pengaruh Gaya Kepemimpinan Transactional, Transformational, Authentic Dan Authoritarian Terhadap Kinerja Guru Madrasah Tsanawiyah Di Kudus. *AL-TANZIM: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 4(1), 70–80. <https://doi.org/10.33650/al-tanzim.v4i1.938>
- Ragnhild Eg, Tønnesen, O. D., & Tennfjord, M. K. (2023). A scoping review of personalized user experiences on social media: The interplay between algorithms and human factors. *Computers in Human Behavior Reports*, 9(July 2022). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chbr.2022.100253>
- Ulil Multazam. (2023). Gaya Kepemimpinan Transaksional, Transformasional Dan Kinerja Guru. *Ta'dibi : Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 12(1), 58–77. <https://doi.org/10.61088/tadibi.v12i1.631>